

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  | **The Police and Crime Commissioner for Cleveland and the Chief Constable Cleveland Police** |
|  | **Assurance Review of HR Recruitment** |
|  | **February 2019** |
|  | **FINAL** |
|  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Executive Summary** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **OVERALL ASSURANCE ASSESSMENT** |  | **OVERALL CONCLUSION** |
|  |  | **The Force has a well-directed and managed recruitment process that provides for an appropriate audit trail for the actions undertaken in recruiting staff and officers. Some controls, however, could be further strengthened with regard to record keeping.**   * **Job descriptions and Person Specifications are not currently dated or version controlled.** * **Interview records such as interviewee scoring sheets could not be evidenced for some of testing sample.** * **The processes adopted provide for appropriate segregation of duties with People Services co-ordinating the process.** |
|  |  |  |
| **SCOPE** |  | **ACTION POINTS** |
| The review considered the arrangements for the selection and appointment process. The review also considered the arrangements for any additions to basic salary that are provided to staff as part of their contract of employment. The scope of the review did not include appropriateness of salary scales; individual appointments; or non-salary benefits. |  | |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | | **Urgent** | **Important** | **Routine** | **Operational** | | **0** | **2** | **0** | **1** | |

|  |
| --- |
| **Management Action Plan - Priority 1, 2 and 3 Recommendations** |

| **Rec.** | **Risk Area** | **Finding** | **Recommendation** | **Priority** | **Management**  **Comments** | **Implementation**  **Timetable**  **(dd/mm/yy)** | **Responsible**  **Officer**  **(Job Title)** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Directed | During the sample testing undertaken during the audit it was noted that these documents did not hold a date or any version control reference. Without such information there is a risk that incorrect job descriptions and person specifications may be used by departments or issued to potential applicants. | Job Description and Person Specification documentation be dated and version controlled. | 2 | *Change the job description/person spec to have an element of version control. Currently in progress and Could be implement with effect from 1st March 2019.* | *01/03/19* | *Head of People Services* |
| 2 | Compliance | The documentation audit trail for interview scoring and outcomes was found to be incomplete in some of the sample tested. | A review of the process for the receipt of interview records and outcomes be undertaken to ensure that all required documentation is returned to People Services form the Hiring Manager/Interviewer(s). | 2 | *A review will take place into this action during the next financial year.* | *04/04/20* | *Head of People Services* |

|  |
| --- |
| **Operational Effectiveness Matters** |

| **Ref** | **Risk Area** | **Item** | **Management**  **Comments** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Directed | Links to the College of Policing website be removed from the Recruitment and Selection policy to avoid the situation where changes have been made to this external website and the links no longer work. Signposting be used instead. | *Acknowledged and will amend when Policy is reviewed.* |

|  |
| --- |
| **Detailed Findings** |

**Introduction**

1. This review was carried out in September 2018 as part of the planned internal audit work for 2018/19. Based on the work carried out an overall assessment of the overall adequacy of the arrangements to mitigate the key control risk areas is provided in the Executive Summary.

**Background**

1. Recruitment is an important part of managing the Police Force and its staff. Robust processes are required to ensure that all expected checks are undertaken in the recruitment and selection process and that transparency can be provided should there be a need to review any appointments.

**Materiality**

1. In the five months to the end of August 2018 a total of 43 civilian, 78 Student Special Constables staff have been recruited.

**Key Findings & Action Points**

1. The key control and operational practice findings that need to be addressed in order to strengthen the control environment are set out in the Management and Operational Effectiveness Action Plans. Recommendations for improvements should be assessed for their full impact before they are implemented.

**Scope and Limitations of the Review**

1. The review considered the arrangements for the selection and appointment process. The review also considered the arrangements for any additions to basic salary that are provided to staff as part of their contract of employment. The scope of the review did not include appropriateness of salary scales; individual appointments; or non-salary benefits.
2. The definition of the type of review, the limitations and the responsibilities of management in regard to this review are set out in the Annual Plan.

**Disclaimer**

1. The matters raised in this report are only those that came to the attention of the auditor during the course of the internal audit review and are not necessarily a comprehensive statement of all the weaknesses that exist or all the improvements that might be made. This report has been prepared solely for management's use and must not be recited or referred to in whole or in part to third parties without our prior written consent. No responsibility to any third party is accepted as the report has not been prepared, and is not intended, for any other purpose. TIAA neither owes nor accepts any duty of care to any other party who may receive this report and specifically disclaims any liability for loss, damage or expense of whatsoever nature, which is caused by their reliance on our report.

**Risk Area Assurance Assessments**

1. The definitions of the assurance assessments are:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Substantial Assurance** | There is a robust system of internal controls operating effectively to ensure that risks are managed and process objectives achieved. |
| **Reasonable Assurance** | The system of internal controls is generally adequate and operating effectively but some improvements are required to ensure that risks are managed and process objectives achieved. |
| **Limited Assurance** | The system of internal controls is generally inadequate or not operating effectively and significant improvements are required to ensure that risks are managed and process objectives achieved. |
| **No Assurance** | There is a fundamental breakdown or absence of core internal controls requiring immediate action. |

**Acknowledgement**

1. We would like to thank staff for their co-operation and assistance during the course of our work.

**Release of Report**

1. The table below sets out the history of this report.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Date draft report issued:** | 19th December 2018 |  |
| **Date management responses received:** | 29th January 2019 |  |
| **Date final report issued:** | 4th February 2019 |  |

1. The following matters were identified in reviewing the Key Risk Control Objective:

|  |
| --- |
| **Directed Risk: Failure to direct the process through approved policy & procedures.** |

* 1. The Recruitment and Selection policy was originally introduced in 2011 and has been reviewed and updated several times with the most recent review and approval taking place in March 2016. The policy is next due for review in December 2018.
  2. The policy is clear in that it is the aim of Cleveland Police to ensure that all Police Officers, Police Staff, members of the Special Constabulary, and Volunteers are recruited and selected in accordance with both national and local policies and procedures.
  3. The policy confirms that the Force is committed to adhering to the national recruitment and selection guidelines provided by the College of Policing, concerning the recruitment and selection of newly appointed Police Officers, Police Community Support Officers and Special Constables.
  4. For Police Staff employed by the Police and Crime Commissioner for Cleveland the recruitment and selection process is documented within the policy.
  5. For staff posts, a Recruitment Authorisation Form must be completed by the relevant Line Manager and duly authorised by the appropriate Head of Service. The process laid down in the Recruitment and Selection policy requires all such requests to be considered by the Resource Monitoring Group for approval. It was advised that this Group was superseded by the Workforce Planning Group towards the beginning of 2017.
  6. A recent restructure has taken place and an HR Business Partner has been appointed to provide the approval for posts that need to be recruited. The next planned review of the Recruitment and Selection policy will address this change and the change referenced in paragraph 11.5 above.
  7. It was also noted that the policy includes links to the College of Policing website for information such as national recruitment and selection guidelines for both Police Officers and PCSO as well as guidelines for Special Constabulary recruitment. The links were found to no longer be active and as the College of Policing website is an external site the Force would not be aware of changes made to specific areas of the website. It is, therefore, not practical to include such links in the policy, however, the College of Policing website should still be signposted.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Operational**  **Effectiveness Matter: 1** | **Links to the College of Policing website be removed from the Recruitment and Selection policy to avoid the situation where changes have been made to this external website and the links no longer work. Signposting be used instead.** |

* 1. Job descriptions and Person Specifications are documented and held in a standard format. These documents are issued by People Services (Sopra Steria) to recruiting managers as part of the recruitment process. Changes can only be made to job descriptions and person specifications following approval by the Grading Panel.
  2. During the sample testing undertaken during the audit it was noted that these documents did not hold a date or any version control reference. Without such information there is a risk that incorrect job descriptions and person specifications may be used by departments or issued to potential applicants.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Recommendation: 1** | **Job Description and Person Specification documentation be dated and version controlled.** |
| **Priority: 2** |

* 1. Vacant positions are advertised on the Cleveland Police website where a description of the job is provided along with key details such as contract hours, closing date, salary, contract type and the location the role is based at. A link is provided to allow potential applicants to download the job description and person specification.
  2. A further link is provided for applicants to apply for the job. This takes the user to the Engage website, which provides an electronic application process that commences with them registering and recording and interest in the job. The full application form is provided through this website with all application being required to be submitted through this method. A Frequently Asked Questions section provides additional assistance to users. It was also noted that the format of the webpage can be changed, including font type, font size and colour contrast.
  3. Adverts for vacancies are only posted on the Force's website and are in a standard agreed format. The hiring manager is provided with the proposed advert by People Services for review before being finalised, reviewed and posted by People Services.
  4. All applications are received electronically and access to submission sis restricted to nominated personnel only.
  5. Hiring managers are provided with a Guide to the Competency and Values Framework (CVF) and How to Use for Interviews. A standard suite of documentation is used for the shortlisting, interview and selection process. This includes the following:
* Shortlisting Matrix;
* CVF Interview Marking Grid;
* CVF Interview Feedback Sheet; and
* Interview Result Form.

|  |
| --- |
| **Compliance Risk: Failure to comply with approved policy and procedure leads to potential losses.** |

* 1. A sample of nine recent Police Staff appointments was selected for review.
  2. Recruitment Authorisation Forms were evidenced for seven of the sample. The remaining two posts were Home Office funded roles and the authorisation was given by the Head of People and Development.
  3. An audit trail of applicant interests and submission was held on Engage and documentation was available to support the shortlisting process and outcomes.
  4. Letters inviting applicants to attend interviews were available as well as an audit trail of any interaction with the applicant in regard to dates and times for the interviews.
  5. The audit trail for interview outcomes was not able to be adequately evidenced in all of the sample selected. The following was identified:
* Electronic copies of the relevant paperwork were held and evidenced for four of the sample reviewed.
* A paper hardcopy version was evidenced for one of the sample reviewed.
* An email trail was evidenced for two of the sample.
* There was no records available for two of the sample.
  1. It was also found that the interview scoring sheets for one of the posts had not been returned to People Services. In addition, there was no evidence to support issuing of regret letters for one of the roles.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Recommendation: 2** | **A review of the process for the receipt of interview records and outcomes be undertaken to ensure that all required documentation is returned to People Services form the Hiring Manager/Interviewer(s).** |
| **Priority: 2** |

* 1. Conditional offer letters were sent to all successful candidates with a record maintained and evidenced.
  2. Evidence to support the required pre-employment checks was also seen for all roles review. This included right to work, identification checks and the taking up of references.
  3. A formal offer letter was also evidenced for each role in the sample along with the appropriate contract.
  4. A sample of four applicants for police staff was also selected for review. This related to the recruitment of Special Constables. A detailed audit trail was evident for all four applicants that included the following:
* Advert;
* Guidance;
* Application Form;
* External Marking;
* Assessment Centre; and
* Confirmation of Progression.

This recruitment was still ongoing at the time of the audit.

* 1. Two Volunteer Manager applications were also selected for review and evidence was provided to support the required process being followed with all relevant records being held by People Services.

---------------