

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  | **The Crime Commissioner for Cleveland Police and the Chief Constable Cleveland Police** |
|  | **Assurance Review of Duty Management System** |
|  | **February 2019** |
|  | **FINAL** |
|  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Executive Summary** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **OVERALL ASSURANCE ASSESSMENT** |  | **OVERALL CONCLUSION** |
|  |  | |  |  | | --- | --- | | **Overall the Duty Management System is working well with any errors or adjustment being corrected in a timely manner.** | | |  | **The policy/procedures for attendance is currently being updated to reflect current working practices.** | |  | **It was noted that the annual leave policy had passed its review date and the attendance policy had a misleading review date.** | |  | **Control issues need to be monitored when the Sopra Steria contract ends and the service transfers back to the Force.** | |  | **The staff at Sopra Steria are very experienced in managing the DMS system which is now well established.** | |
|  |  |  |
| **SCOPE** |  | **ACTION POINTS** |
| Rationale:  This is a key area of the Force’s service delivery.  Scope:  The review considered the effectiveness of the Duty Management System arrangements. |  | |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | | **Urgent** | **Important** | **Routine** | **Operational** | | **0** | **0** | **2** | **1** | |

|  |
| --- |
| **Management Action Plan - Priority 1, 2 and 3 Recommendations** |

| **Rec.** | **Risk Area** | **Finding** | **Recommendation** | **Priority** | **Management**  **Comments** | **Implementation**  **Timetable**  **(dd/mm/yy)** | **Responsible**  **Officer**  **(Job Title)** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Directed | The Annual Leave Policy (Policy Ref: 216) is currently at Version 2.5 having being reviewed in March 2014 and due for review in October 2018. It was noted that there was a version change in June 2018, however, the full review of the policy is now overdue. | In accordance with the recommended review date, which was October 2018, the review of the Annual Leave Policy 216 be undertaken at the earliest opportunity. | 3 | *Noted* | *01/02/20* | *Head of People Services* |
| 2 | Directed | Attendance Management - (Policy103) - This policy was last reviewed in June 2018 and is due for review every two years. However, at section 3.22.5 it states "There is at November 2017 a review of the force Annual leave policy on-going then this may impact on the information provided above." It is misleading if matters need to be addressed in the document but the impression is that a full review has been undertaken which has moved forward the next review date by two years. | When a review of a Policy document is undertaken this is for the whole document. Should minor amendments be required between reviews this be noted in the version control section of the document. | 3 | *Noted – The new Policy is in the stage of a ‘soft launch’ with the Force in order to collate feedback and will go live within the next two weeks.* | *01/04/19* | *Head of People Services* |

|  |
| --- |
| **Operational Effectiveness Matters** |

| **Ref** | **Risk Area** | **Item** | **Management**  **Comments** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Operational | The Force should note the control issue when the current Sopra Steria contract expires and the system administrators from Sopra Steria become Force employees. | *Acknowledged.* |

|  |
| --- |
| **Detailed Findings** |

**Introduction**

1. This review was carried out in December 2018 as part of the planned internal audit work for 2018/19. Based on the work carried out an overall assessment of the overall adequacy of the arrangements to mitigate the key control risk areas is provided in the Executive Summary.

**Background**

1. Cleveland Police, as at October 2018, had a budget for some 1236 Police Officers and some 319 Police Staff. The Duty Management System (DMS) has been in place with Cleveland Police for some time and was upgraded in 2015. There is a front end application, Oracle Self Service, to enable all staff and Police Officers to enter data for leave, overtime, time off in lieu and sick leave. The Oracle Self Service system then feeds into the DMS system. The DMS system enables the storage of the data on annual leave, Time off in Lieu (TOIL), Rest Days in Lieu (RDIL), sickness days and overtime for all employees and it facilitates staff/officer planning and shift arrangements. If an employee works overtime or works on a rest day, they are entitled to claim TOIL, paid overtime or RDIL. A rest day is any day where an employee is not scheduled to work.

**Materiality**

1. The Duty Management System is the mechanism by which Cleveland Police manage officer and staff time which is critical for the Force.

**Key Findings & Action Points**

1. The key control and operational practice findings that need to be addressed in order to strengthen the control environment are set out in the Management and Operational Effectiveness Action Plans. Recommendations for improvements should be assessed for their full impact before they are implemented.

**Scope and Limitations of the Review**

1. The review will appraise the effectiveness of the Duty Management System arrangements.
2. The definition of the type of review, the limitations and the responsibilities of management in regard to this review are set out in the Annual Plan.

**Disclaimer**

1. The matters raised in this report are only those that came to the attention of the auditor during the course of the internal audit review and are not necessarily a comprehensive statement of all the weaknesses that exist or all the improvements that might be made. This report has been prepared solely for management's use and must not be recited or referred to in whole or in part to third parties without our prior written consent. No responsibility to any third party is accepted as the report has not been prepared, and is not intended, for any other purpose. TIAA neither owes nor accepts any duty of care to any other party who may receive this report and specifically disclaims any liability for loss, damage or expense of whatsoever nature, which is caused by their reliance on our report.

**Risk Area Assurance Assessments**

1. The definitions of the assurance assessments are:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Substantial Assurance** | There is a robust system of internal controls operating effectively to ensure that risks are managed and process objectives achieved. |
| **Reasonable Assurance** | The system of internal controls is generally adequate and operating effectively but some improvements are required to ensure that risks are managed and process objectives achieved. |
| **Limited Assurance** | The system of internal controls is generally inadequate or not operating effectively and significant improvements are required to ensure that risks are managed and process objectives achieved. |
| **No Assurance** | There is a fundamental breakdown or absence of core internal controls requiring immediate action. |

**Acknowledgement**

1. We would like to thank staff for their co-operation and assistance during the course of our work.

**Release of Report**

1. The table below sets out the history of this report.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Date draft report issued:** | 21st December 2018 |  |
| **Date management responses received:** | 29th January 2019 |  |
| **Date final report issued:** | 4th February 2019 |  |

1. The following matters were identified in reviewing the Key Risk Control Objective:

|  |
| --- |
| **Directed Risk: Failure to direct the process through approved policy & procedures.** |

* 1. A previous internal audit had been undertaken in September 2014 by Baker Tilly. Four Recommendations were made:
     + Rec 1 - *Where there is a new employee, or a current employee has annual leave carried over from the previous year, checks should be made on the figures entered into DMS to ensure their entitlement is correctly calculated and transferred.* This recommendation at the time was deemed to be in place. This has been confirmed.
     + Rec 2 - *When a Supervisor approves a Time off in Lieu (TOIL) request the system should highlight the employee’s available balance on screen, as this will help ensure negative balances do not occur. This may also be considered for approval of annual leave and Rest Days in Lieu (RDIL).* This would be addressed with the proposed 2015 upgrade. This has been confirmed.
     + Rec 3 - *All staff should ensure that sickness dates are accurately recorded within the Duty Management System (DMS). Supervisors and staff should be reminded of the requirement to remove sick leave where an employee returns to work within the seven days that the system automatically applies when sickness is reported. In addition, it should be investigated whether an error message or warning message can be built into the DMS to prevent staff from entering past dates into the system when updating sick leave records*. This issue was understood at the time and was being managed. No changes were proposed.
     + Rec 4 - *A single database should be used for duty management that should be fully utilised by all employees to ensure that records are accurate and up to date, including the recording of: Annual leave; Time off in Lieu (TOIL); Rest Days in Lieu (RDIL); Sickness; and Overtime.* This recommendation would be addressed by the proposed 2015 upgrade. This has been confirmed.
  2. The Duty Management System has been working well for some time and as such does not therefore appear on the Force's Risk Register.
  3. The Annual Leave Policy (Policy Ref: 216) is currently at Version 2.5 having being reviewed in March 2014 and due for review in October 2018. It was noted that there was a version change in June 2018, however, the full review of the policy is now overdue.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Recommendation: 1** | **In accordance with the recommended review date, which was October 2018, the review of the Annual Leave Policy 216 be undertaken at the earliest opportunity.** |
| **Priority: 3** |

* 1. The annual leave and statutory holiday scheme is designed to ensure that all police officers and police staff get the right proportion of annual leave and statutory holidays to which they are entitled. The annual leave procedure ensures that all police officers and police staff take a break from work in line with the requirements of the Working Time Directive and Police Regulations. The procedure also ensures that all officers and staff are aware of their leave allowances and the procedural requirements they must follow when requesting annual leave.
  2. Leave entitlement is expressed in hours to allow the greatest flexibility for the different working patterns throughout the organisation. For a police officer this may be more or less than the basic 8 hours per day. This equates for a full time officer working 40 hours per week. For a member of police staff the basic day is 7.4 hours. This equates for a full time member of police staff working 37 hours per week. The appendices of the policy identifies the annual leave entitlement (in days) for each rank and the ratio of officer permitted to be on leave given the size of their unit. These procedures are clear and easily understood.
  3. The Police Federation Quick Reference Guide is used as the policy document for Overtime and Rest Days In Lieu (RDIL).

DMS User Guide V3 - This is a guide for access to the DMS/Oracle Self Service system. It explains the following:

* How to accurately record the time worked.
  + - Automatically work out overtime entitlement (in-line with Winsor).
    - Allow overtime claims to be tracked.
    - Show accurate leave balances and warn operatives if they go over their entitlement.
    - Allow notes to be added to duties.
    - Allow operatives to see duties for anyone in the force.
    - Record flexi time for police staff and show balances.
    - Find out who reports to which supervisor.
    - Allow searches for officers with up to two specific skills
  1. Guidance is provided for the DMS Booking on and Booking off (BoBo) system. The BoBo system facilitates all staff and officers recording their time within the DMS system. It follows a general principle that officers and staff will record their hours honestly, acknowledging that for the vast majority that will mean an approximate start and finish time (e.g. to the nearest 15 minutes). The system does not expect absolute mathematical accuracy and if operatives are a few minutes out here or there then that is perfectly acceptable, as the focus of the system is to obtain a view on who is at work, when and where.
  2. The Attendance Management (Policy Ref: 103) was last reviewed in June 2018 and is due for review every two years. However, at section 3.22.5 it states "There is at November 2017 a review of the force Annual leave policy on-going then this may impact on the information provided above." It is misleading if matters need to be addressed in the document but the impression is that a full review has been undertaken, which has moved forward the next review date by two years. It is therefore recommended that when a review is undertaken this is for the whole document. Should minor amendments be required between reviews this can be noted in the version control section of the document.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Recommendation: 2** | **When a review of a Policy document is undertaken this is for the whole document. Should minor amendments be required between reviews this be noted in the version control section of the document.** |
| **Priority: 3** |

* 1. The document covers the following attendance issues:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * + - Individual Responsibilities | * + - Long Term Sickness |
| * + - First Line Manager Responsibilities | * + - Return to Work |
| * + - Service Unit Manager Responsibilities | * + - Attendance Management Meeting |
| * + - People Services and Occupational Health | * + - Attendance Support Plan |
| * + - Sickness Criteria | * + - Government Fit for Work Service |
| * + - Sickness Notification Procedure | * + - Equality Act 2010 |
| * + - Eighth Day of Sickness | * + - Health Management Group |
| * + - Fit Notes | * + - Regulation 28 – Police Officers |
| * + - Continuing Sickness Absence | * + - Police Staff Reduction of Pay |
| * + - Management Contact | * + - Annual Leave / Sickness Absence |
| * + - Before the Visit | * + - Attending Court Whilst on Sickness Absence |
| * + - At the Visit | * + - Medical and Dental Appointments |

|  |
| --- |
| **Compliance Risk: Failure to comply with approved policy and procedure leads to potential losses.** |

* 1. Shift arrangements are developed by the Sopra Steria HR training team in the DMS. These shift arrangements then become available to officers within DMS and are accessed via the Oracle Self Service system.
  2. Resource allocation is a manual process which takes place by supervisors/line management prior to recording in the Duty Management System. Once resource allocation has taken place and the data entered on DMS the officer/staff member is then able to identify their leave requirement via the Oracle Self Service System.
  3. A small sample of staff and Officers have been reviewed to verify how the system works and records prime date for time. From examination it was confirmed that the system was working as expected and controls are in place with leave etc. being approved by an appropriate supervisor.
  4. Training is available as required. If a common repeated issue arises then it is likely that all staff/officers will receive training to rectify the situation. Training will be provided either on an individual basis or for all staff/officers depending upon the issue that arises. DMS training is included as part of the induction procedures.
  5. Shift patterns are discussed and agreed outside of the DMS system. Once agreed the DMS system is updated for the new shift pattern. Officers when accessing the Oracle Self Service system will be informed of their shift arrangements.
  6. The Oracle Self Service system is the front end application that captures all the time records for the officers and staff.
  7. Sopra Steria HR identify, collate, monitor and report on absence data extracted from the DMS system. The ongoing cost of overtime is monitored by the Finance Team at Sopra Steria and reported to each Head of Department and corporately. Supervisors are informed of time discrepancies for them to resolve with their staff.
  8. The DMS system has built in the various regulations for hours worked, absence, overtime etc. and therefore calculates the correct output from the approved input data. In addition, the system manages hours worked, time owed, overtime etc. again from approved time input. The Finance Team at Sopra Steria monitor and report on the financial output from the system.
  9. The DMS system administrators (three in number - 2.8 full time equivalent) have full access to the system. Other access is dependent upon rank and is given to enable the system to work effectively but with appropriate control.
  10. Any exceptions are identified by the Exceptions reporting function every day with all exceptions cleared down the same day. Exceptions may be only one or two in number in a day but may increase up to twelve to fifteen in a day. They are, however, a very manageable number with most being rectified within a matter of minutes either because the system administrator can identify the problem or a short conversation with the member of staff/Officer can resolve the matter.
  11. Other key report are provided by the system and include:
* Interface Log: This is a report that identifies any leave issues and is used to fix any leave requests that have not transferred to DMS from Oracle Self Service.
* DMS Mismatch Report: This report picks up any differences between Oracle Self Service and DMS for leave, sickness, days in lieu and TOIL issues.
* Sort Sequence Report: This report gives access to team information on booking on and booking off (BOBO), duties and balances.

All reports were examined and found to provide the system administrators with exceptions and errors that could immediately be corrected, thereby maintaining an accurate DMS database of information.

* 1. The output data from the DMS system is reconciled by the Sopra Steria Finance team. Each Department Head receives a regular update on overtime and other financial matters arising from the system. These are collated and a corporate financial report is prepared for the Chief Finance Officer and Chief Constable on a monthly basis.
  2. The DMS system has an audit reporting function and all transactions are recorded within the audit trail. This means, for example, that if a subsequent deletion takes place both the original entry and the correcting entry are retained within the audit trail system.

|  |
| --- |
| **Operational Risk: Failure to identify opportunities to operate more efficiently or to be prepared for forthcoming changes.** |

* 1. The DMS system is currently managed by Sopra Steria who is a third party contractor and as such the system does not manage the time or activities of the staff who manage the system, as these are controlled and paid by Sopra Steria. Later next year when the current contract expires with Sopra Steria the team will transfer back to Cleveland Police and the DMS administrators will then become employees and they will be active within the DMS system. The Force should consider putting in place appropriate control measures for all transferred staff who have administrator rights access, as these staff could create entries in the system for their own benefit which could go undetected.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Operational Effectiveness Matter: 1** | **The Force should note the control issue when the current Sopra Steria contract expires and the system administrators from Sopra Steria become Force employees.** |

* 1. Since the 2015 upgrade the DMS system has worked well with no major problems arising.

|  |
| --- |
| **Reputational Risk: Failure to deliver in a manner that meets the expectations of the organisation.** |

* 1. The customer service team at Sopra Steria take/deal with all front line feedback with regard to the DMS system. All DMS queries have to be directed via the Customer Services Team who log the query onto a system called Stars. The Sopra Steria HR team will then access Stars on an ongoing basis and as an experienced team they manage a number of these queries as they arise. Those which are of a more technical nature are referred to the system administrators to progress. The Stars system is regularly monitored by senior management within Sopra Steria. There have not been any actual complaints received regarding the DMS system. The customer interface via Stars is a good indicator as to whether there are any inherent issues with the DMS system. Given that some 1800 staff and officers interface with Oracle Self Service/DMS every day there are very few queries arising and recorded on Stars.

---------------