



THE POLICE & CRIME COMMISSIONER FOR CLEVELAND

DECISION RECORD FORM

REQUEST: For PCC approval.

Title: CPC-0001610 – Accident Repair Service Framework for Emergency Service Vehicles

Executive Summary: The Police and Crime Commissioner for Northumbria acting as lead invited Durham and Cleveland Police and North East Ambulance Service to participate in the contract for the provision of Accident Repair Service for a four year period commencing 1st August 2017. (Cleveland Police 3rd October 2017)

The tender was divided into lots per location – lot details below, in order to give localised suppliers in each organisation area the opportunity to bid for business and an optional combined lot for all organisations.

- Lot 1 - Northumbria Police, Northumberland Fire & Rescue & Tyne & Wear Fire & Rescue.
- Lot 2 – Durham Constabulary & Durham Fire & Rescue.
- Lot 3 – Cleveland Police & Cleveland Fire & Rescue.
- Lot 4 – North East Ambulance Service.
- Lot 5 - Entire North East Region covering all participating organisations.

For the purpose of Lot 5, this lot would only be considered if there was a significant benefit to all the participating organisations compared to the benefits of the separate lots. For the purpose of this Framework a significant benefit shall be defined as:-

“An advantage which all or the majority of organisations can benefit from, such as more advantageous levels of service and or additional savings generated in comparison to the award of individual lots”.

The final outcome of the evaluation is shown in the table below:

	Accreditation (Industry Standard)	Security of Premises	Recovery Fleet Capacity	Quality	Price Score	Total (%)
Bidder 1	Pass	Pass	Pass	60.00%	40% £24.95/Hour	100.00%
Bidder 2	Pass	Pass	Fail – would have to use subcontractors	30.00%	35.64% £28.00/Hour	65.65%
Bidder 3	Fail	Pass	Fail – would have to use subcontractors	30.00%	36.96% £27.00/Hour	66.96%
Bidder 4	Fail	Pass	Fail – would have to use subcontractors	42.50%	35.64% £28.00/Hour	78.14%

Tenders have been assessed by an evaluation panel consisting of fleet and procurement representatives from Northumbria, Durham and Cleveland Police Forces and the North East Ambulance Services on the basis of 40% price (labour costs) and 60% quality.

The quality weighting covered the methodology for undertaking the full end to end service, timescales for repair and proposals for minimising the down time of accident damaged vehicles and staff training & development.

In addition the Quality assessment covered a number of pass/fail requirements. These included security of premises, the capacity of the contractors recovery fleet and the requirement to be PAS (the industry standard) accredited for damage repair and recovery/breakdowns.

Following the evaluation process Bidder 1 was the only organisation that could demonstrate that they could meet all of the participating organisation's requirements and was awarded the contract under Lot 5. The evaluation has been conducted in a fair, comprehensive, thorough and transparent process.

Decision: That the PCC notes the procurement method, analysis used and the recommendation put forward by the Evaluation Team.

That the approve Bidder 1 as the best value solution to provide the accident repair of Cleveland Police Force operational vehicles.

OPCC Lead Officer: Judith Nellist

Contractor Details (if applicable): CF Motoring Services Ltd, Chain Bridge Road, Blaydon, Tyne & Wear NE21 5SZ.

Implications:

Has consideration been taken of the following:	Yes	No
Financial	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Equality & Diversity	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Human Rights	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sustainability	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Risk	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

(If yes please provide further details below)

Decision Required – Supporting Information

Financial Implications: (Must include comments of the PCC's Chief Finance Officer where the decision has financial implications)

In 2016/17 Cleveland Police's estimated spend for parts and labour was £117,003, and if applying the new hourly rate of £25 per hour would have given a potential saving of £18,720. If the same principle is applied to the period 2014-2017, the average spend was £111,823 for parts and labour with a potential saving of £17,891 or 16% per annum if the new hourly rate is applied.

Although there is budget provision which exists for this expenditure, it is difficult to assign an actual budget figure to this specific activity. This is due to a variance in vehicle accident numbers, other expenditure such as insurance premiums allocated to this budget line and income transactions following Legal activity.

The hourly rate currently paid to the vehicle accident repairers is £30 per hour, the new contract hourly rate price is £25 per hour, and therefore there is a reduction of £5 per hour.

Legal Implications: (Must include comments of the Monitoring Officer where the decision has legal implication)

Having read this report and having considered such information as has been provided at the time of being asked to express this view, the Chief Executive is satisfied that this report does not ask the PCC to make a decision which would (or would be likely to) give rise to a contravention of the law.

Equality and Diversity Implications

None arise.

Human Rights Implications

None arise.

Sustainability Implications

The recommended bidder for this contract has a very good understanding of Cleveland Police requirements as well as significant experience and competence within the car industry; therefore, no significant issues are anticipated.

Risk Management Implications

None arise.

OFFICER APPROVAL

Monitoring Officer

I have been consulted about the decision and confirm that financial, legal, and equalities advice has been taken into account. I am satisfied that this is an appropriate request to be submitted to the Police and Crime Commissioner.

Signed  Date 4/10/17

Police and Crime Commissioner:

The above request HAS my approval.

Signed  Date 4/10/17



Report of the Chief Constable to the Police and Crime Commissioner for Cleveland – September 2017

Status: For Decision

Procurement Report for the Provision of an Accident Repair Service Framework for Emergency Service Vehicles.

1. Purpose

- 1.1 The provision for an Accident Repair Service Framework for Emergency Service Vehicles.
- 1.2 Cleveland Fleet vehicles are currently repaired by authorised approved body shops based within the Cleveland area and are charged insurance body shop labour rates.
- 1.3 We currently have a fleet comprising of the following vehicles:

Vehicle Type	Quantity
Cars	209
Light Vans (under 3.5 tonnes)	60
Medium Vans (between 3.7 – 7.5 tonnes)	20
LGV (over 7.5 tonnes)	0
Motorcycles	11
Fleet Total	300

- 1.4 The service will include the collection, storage, repair and delivery of the vehicle to the participating emergency service and is expected to start on 1st August 2017. (Cleveland Police 3rd October 2017)

2. Recommendations

- 2.1 Note the procurement method, analysis used and the recommendation put forward by the Evaluation Team.
- 2.2 It is recommended that the most economically advantageous tender be accepted is Bidder 1.

3. Background

- 3.1 The Police and Crime Commissioner for Northumbria acting as lead invited Durham and Cleveland Police and North East Ambulance Service to participate in the contract for the provision of Accident Repair Service for a four year period commencing 1st August 2017.
- 3.2 The contract is also available to Northumbria Fire & Rescue Services, Tyne and Wear Fire & Rescue Service, County Durham and Darlington Fire & Rescue Service and Cleveland Fire Brigade should they wish to access the contract at a later date.
- 3.3 The tender was divided into lots per location – lot details below, in order to give localised suppliers in each organisation area the opportunity to bid for business and an optional combined lot for all organisations.

Lot 1 - Northumbria Police, Northumberland Fire & Rescue & Tyne & Wear Fire & Rescue.

Lot 2 – Durham Constabulary & Durham Fire & Rescue.

Lot 3 – Cleveland Police & Cleveland Fire & Rescue.

Lot 4 – North East Ambulance Service.

Lot 5 - Entire North East Region covering all participating organisations.

For the purpose of Lot 5, this lot would only be considered if there was a significant benefit to all the participating organisations compared to the benefits of the separate lots. For the purpose of this Framework a significant benefit shall be defined as:-

“An advantage which all or the majority of organisations can benefit from, such as more advantageous levels of service and or additional savings generated in comparison to the award of individual lots”.

- 3.4 Tenders have been assessed by an evaluation panel consisting of fleet and procurement representatives from Northumbria, Durham and Cleveland Police Forces and the North East Ambulance Services on the basis of 40% price (labour costs) and 60% quality.
- 3.5 The quality weighting covered the methodology for undertaking the full end to end service, timescales for repair and proposals for minimising the down time of accident damaged vehicles and staff training & development.
- 3.6 In addition the Quality assessment covered a number of pass/fail requirements. These included security of premises, the capacity of the contractors recovery fleet and the requirement to be PAS (the industry standard) accredited for damage repair and recovery/breakdowns.

3.7 The final outcome of the evaluation is shown in the table below:

	Accreditation (Industry Standard)	Security of Premises	Recovery Fleet Capacity	Quality	Price Score	Total (%)
Bidder 1	Pass	Pass	Pass	60.00%	40% £24.95/Hour	100.00%
Bidder 2	Pass	Pass	Fail – would have to use subcontractors	30.00%	35.64% £28.00/Hour	65.65%
Bidder 3	Fail	Pass	Fail – would have to use subcontractors	30.00%	36.96% £27.00/Hour	66.96%
Bidder 4	Fail	Pass	Fail – would have to use subcontractors	42.50%	35.64% £28.00/Hour	78.14%

3.8 Following the evaluation process Bidder 1 was the only organisation that could demonstrate that they could meet all of the participating organisation's requirements and was awarded the contract under Lot 5. A further benefit is the free collection and delivery service Bidder 1 offers.

4. Implications

4.1 Finance

In 2016 – 2017 Cleveland Police's estimated spend for parts and labour was £117,003, and if applying the new hourly rate of £25/hour would have given a potential saving of £18,720.

If the same principle is applied to the period 2014-2017, the average spend was £111,823 for parts and labour with a potential saving of £17,891 or 16% per annum if the new hourly rate is applied.

Although there is budget provision which exists for this expenditure, it is difficult to assign an actual budget figure to this specific activity. This is due to a variance in vehicle accident numbers, other expenditure such as insurance premiums allocated to this budget line and income transactions following Legal activity.

The hourly rate currently paid to the vehicle accident repairers is £30/hour, the new contract hourly rate price is £25/hour, and therefore there is a reduction of £5/hour. This cannot be identified as a saving due to the nature of the contract, that is, as the throughput is variable year on year a final anticipated saving cannot be quantified. However it would allow for a greater number of repair hours to be carried out for the same overall expenditure. In addition the new contract includes vehicle recovery as part of the contract terms and therefore there will be reduction in the vehicle recovery spend.

4.2 Legal

Terms and Conditions of the Police and Crime Commissioner for Northumbria

4.3 Diversity & Equal Opportunities

There are no diversity & equal opportunities implications associated with the award of this contract.

4.4 Human Rights Act

There are no Human Rights implications associated with the award of this contract.

4.5 Sustainability

There are no sustainability implications associated with the award of this contract.

4.6 Risk

The recommended Bidder for this contract has a very good understanding of the forces requirements as well as significant experience and competence within the car industry; therefore, no significant issues are anticipated.

5. Conclusions

5.1 Bidder 1 has scored the highest on both price and quality and therefore has submitted the most economically advantageous tender. It is also the only organisation that has demonstrated that they can meet all of the participating organisation's requirements.

5.2 All other organisations have confirmed their commitment to proceed with the recommended tenderer.

Evaluation team:

Northumbria – Fleet Manager & Procurement Officer

Cleveland – Senior Fleet Assistant & Technical Fleet Assistant

Durham – Fleet Manager

NEAS – Fleet Manager